

Review of recent studies

Ayşe Bugra and Sinem Adar, "An Analysis of Social Protection Expenditures in Turkey in A Comparative Perspective", April 2007, Social Policy Watch, Social Policy Forum.

In the report prepared by Social Policy Watch¹, a comparative analysis of social policy developments is made via public social expenditures relative to GDP in Turkey in comparison with European countries over the period 2001-2004. Striking figures can be summarized as following: a) Turkey's public social spending was %11.6 of GDP in 2003 whereas corresponding OECD figure was %20.7; b) share of means-tested benefits (important in the context of poverty alleviation) in GDP is only %0.5 while it is %2.8 for EU-15, %2 for Greece, and %2.5 for Portugal and Spain; c) public spending on education for 0-19 age group in per capita terms is 292 euro in Turkey whereas 2,699 euro for Greece, 3,374 Euro for Portugal and 3,937 for Spain. Given these figures, Bugra and Adar argues that government authorities are trying to transfer social policy responsibilities to voluntary sector by appealing to sentiments of philanthropy and benevolence instead of seeking ways of reordering fiscal authorities in a way to increase public social expenditures.

Full version of the report can be found in the following address:
<<http://www.spf.boun.edu.tr/pages/research.htm>>

Ayşe Bugra, "Poverty and Citizenship: An Overview of the Social-Policy Environment in Republican Turkey", *International Journal of Middle East Studies*, Vol. 39 (2007). 33-52.

In the paper, Ayşe Bugra reflects upon Turkish modernization experience in a historical overview of perspectives on poverty and social policy, and its manifestation on nature of state-society relations and the content of citizenship during the republican period. As opposed to the view that etatism is the defining feature of state-society relations in Turkey, this overview shows that the responsibility for social assistance assigned to and assumed by the political authority has remained very limited throughout the period under study. Until the 1980s, when the country adopted an outward-looking, market-oriented development strategy, several mechanisms that were hardly compatible with the logic of either state redistribution or market exchange substituted for formal social-assistance measures. Today social-policy approaches are in a position to deal with pressures generated by market forces. The social-policy outlook of the current ruling party, which comes from an Islamic political tradition, at times appears to be more in conformity with basic trends observed through capitalist modernization in Europe than with those of both Kemalist authoritarianism and the multiparty period preceding the transition to an open-market economy.

Sinem Adar, "Turkey: Reform in Social Security", *Journal of European Social Policy*, Vol. 17, No. 2 (2007), 167-168.

In the article, Adar addresses current debate on social security reform taking place in Turkey. Social Security Institution (SGK) and Universal Health Insurance (GSS) laws can be seen as second phase of social security reform initiated by Social Security Law passed in 1999; all

¹ SWF is research and monitoring unit in Social Policy Forum following developments in Turkish social policy environment and evaluate them with specific reference to European institutions and policies.

which are reflections of increasing influence of neo-liberal economy on pensions and health system, and it is supported by IMF and other international financial institutions. She argues that even though SGK and GSS bring about beneficiaries such as free provision of health services for those smaller than 18 years old (it is important for tackling with child poverty), and health insurance coverage for immigrants 7000 of which is unrecorded, it has been criticized on the account that it will be financed by security payments depending on level of income instead of social expenditure budget to be financed by taxes. Considering the fact that demographically %50,1 of population is employed in the informal sector and %30 of population cannot benefit from any social security system including green card application, new health insurance laws will result in disparities within and between regions in Turkey and have severe effects on poor people not included in government's definition of poverty. On the other hand, pension payment system will be restructured through prolonging retirement age and social premiums to be made; hence it will give rise to a decrease in the pension payments to be made in the future. Given that Turkey's lump sum social security expenditures relative to GDP is about %12,1 compared to %19 level in EU countries, Turkey should increase its share of transfers to social expenditures rather than pushing government expenditures downwards via conforming to IMF packages and demands made by WB. As an alternative, Adar argues that Turkey should dwell on structural problems concerning creating employment opportunities so as to tackle with poverty.

Tuba Agartan, "Health Sector Reform in Turkey: Old Policies New Politics", Binghamton, < http://www.cevipof.msh-paris.fr/rencontres/colloq/palier/clegg/YR_papers/Agartan.pdf> (08/08/2007)

In the paper, Agartan tries to analyze the policy process in health sector as part of the restructuring of the Turkish welfare state. She adopts an approach that aimed to consider internal politics, attitudes, positions and perceptions of actors and institutional features for the analysis of health policy reform process in the Turkish context. However, in this attempt to identify major actors and their positions on the health reform package of the AK Party government, it aimed to go one step further than simply focusing on the demands of these actors competing for political influence. Following the assumptions of new institutionalism, she tries to highlight the importance of pre-existing macro-institutional structures and entrenched interests on the part of policy actors in explaining the success or failure of reform attempts. In this picture, the predominance of the state and its reluctance to allow participation of interest groups active in health policy have emerged as fundamental characteristics of the Turkish experience with healthcare reforms. All in all, Agartan argues that there is an evidence for thesis that the policy and its reform has been dominated by the executive branches of government and that the unions and Turkish Medical Association (TMA) acted as 'veto players' or 'forces of conservatism' that fight against any change in health care systems, but also she points at the major changes taking place in the field of social policy and the possible changes in this attitude towards interest groups and unions, as the latter learn to participate more actively in the policy processes. She claims that if we were to adopt Ministry of Labor and Social Security's (MoH) definitions of 'transformation' as indicating a long-term process of cumulative attempts to change the system as opposed to 'reform' which involves a radically new program of change, we can conclude that the government's health program represents a significant 'transformation' of the health care system. However, at the same time, this process may be a sign of a more radical 'reform' in the health policymaking where new actors may be gaining more influence as well as old but weak ones are getting stronger.

Çağlar Keyder, Nazan Üstündağ, Tuba Ağartan, Çağrı Yoltar, eds., “Health Policies in Turkey and Europe: Reforms, Problems, and Discussions”, İletişim, September 2007. (available only in Turkish)

Health services are one of the chief responsibilities of state to provide for its citizens. However, how much of these services include what percentage of population, and blind to which groups are set of questions need to be answered. Almost in very developed country, health is becoming a citizenship right. In the other parts of world, similar reformation processes are taking place. In fact, this ‘humane’ attitude supported by IMF and WB purport to keep people in global market game. Along with every reform package, private sectors’ take in health services is enlarging. Supported by the argument that state cannot provide these services efficiently, it is recommended that number of government social services employees should be diminished. Developing countries through passing these reforms in accordance with their conditions are bringing away equity and equality conditions in the first stage. In Turkey, the Universal Health Insurance, far from covering whole population, excludes those who do not pay premiums from any health services. Considering the fact that economic instability prevail in a country like Turkey, it is appalling to think about disastrous effects of a health insurance system based on premiums. In the book, selection from scholars from various parts of Europe, portray how ‘health services’ is conceptualized and its applications in Europe by looking at discussions of problems at the national scales and providing an assessment of proposed reform solutions. This book aims to reveal the inconveniency of ‘buyer-seller’ relation to be established in health services, and to remind that health services should fall in the main responsibility of state to its citizens.

Ayşe Bugra and Çağlar Keyder, “Towards Citizenship Income as A Basic Right”, İletişim, August 2007. (Available only in Turkish)

“No work, No bread” sounds like an unquestioned daily quote. Nevertheless, it resonates in minds of people as of a commonly agreed principle which is in fact naturalized/legitimized by capitalist system. Actually we know that it is not up to preference for nonworking people to find a job; hence being unemployed is neither related with being lazy nor being a parasite. We should also keep in mind of those who are not in a situation to work. Shall we let them to die? Does society bear responsibility for poor people? These are the set of questions raised by Thomas More, Thomas Paine, Charles Fourier, John Stuart Mill, Bertrand Russell, and many other thinkers for whom these questions are starting point for a fundamental moral critique of capitalism. Ayşe Bugra and Çağlar Keyder discuss concept of citizenship income given the intellectual background of writings of these authors. Selected writings in the book elaborate on this concept through explicating different dimensions of the citizenship income and experiences specific to various countries. As opposed to technocratic solutions based on labor market, this book put an emphasis on moral political approach to the citizenship income vis-à-vis basic social rights.

Orhan Kurumuş, Dr.Ayşe Kudat, Ece Sanal Kılıçözölü, Ertan Karabıyık, Dr. İsmet Yalçın, Serkan Ünverdi, Çağlar Keyder, Nazan Üstündağ, “Social and Economic Priorities in Eastern and Southeastern Anatolia”, TESEV Research Report, September 2006.

The TESEV project on social and economic priorities in Eastern and Southeastern Anatolia is coordinated by Dr.Orhan Kurmus and it consists of three parts: Dr. Ayşe Kudat conducted the

study on *The Role of Investments in the Development of Eastern and Southeastern Anatolia*. Prof. Dr. A. Halis Akder prepared the section on *The Role of Agricultural Policy in the Development of South and Southeastern Anatolia* and the study on *the Role of Social Policy in the Development of Eastern and Southeastern Anatolia* was carried out by Prof. Dr. Çağlar Keyder. This research project aims at identifying policies that can be implemented in the short term and would serve as the basis for longer term solutions to socio-economic problems in Eastern and Southeastern Anatolia. Suggestions regarding agriculture, the path and potential evolution of private enterprise and social policy are provided with no discussion of the legislative, regulatory or administrative changes that they would entail, except for brief references to the course of such changes in cases. In the project, proposals are directed at strengthening the bond between citizens and the state and human resources in the region. The administrative and organizational arrangements, the development of educational and organizational capacities needed for the achievement of this goal are of vital importance in terms of the implementation of the policies. The necessity of cooperation between central government and local bodies and organizations is emphasized. In this context, efforts to ensure that local bodies and organizations participate in debates regarding economic development and social policy, make suggestions, and acquire the capacity for contribution to work in these areas, are of fundamental importance.

For the full version of the report: <http://www.undp.org.tr/publicationsDocuments/tesevENG.pdf>

Nick Manning, "Turkey, the EU and Social Policy", *Social Policy & Society*, Vol. 6:4, 2007, p.491–501.

This paper considers what we might expect to be the effect on social policy of Turkish accession to the EU by reviewing the impact of EU membership on social policy in other new member and candidate countries. This effect begins long before membership is finalised, and continues long after membership has been achieved. The patterns of impact can be divided along a number of dimensions: between 'accession' and 'enlargement', state and civil society; centre and periphery; formal and substantive; and different welfare institutions. In the course of reviewing these variations, the paper reflects upon the nature of social policy itself, and in particular the nature of the European Social Model.

Yıldız Ecevit, "A Critical Approach to Women's Entrepreneurship in Turkey", International Labour Office, 2007.

Since the beginning of the 1990s, there has been an increase in women's entrepreneurship development activities by public institutions and civil society organizations as well as international organizations in Turkey. This unforeseeable increase is the result a growing interest in women's entrepreneurship in relation to women's economic participation in Turkey. Promoting entrepreneurship among women has been seen increasingly as a solution to women's unemployment, as well as a means through which women can have a certain degree of economic independence. The objective of this study is to map on women entrepreneurship that aims to gather the key data, information and references on the policy and institutional environment, projects, programs and research in Turkey on the topic. More specifically, this study aims to present current situation in term of institutional framework, policies, projects and research and to analyze and evaluate the instrumentalization of women's entrepreneurship by various institutions and strategies. This study primarily consists of eight parts. The first two parts review prominent national and international institutions in terms of their relevance to women's entrepreneurship. The third part consists of descriptions and reviews of projects and activities concerning women's

entrepreneurship in Turkey. The fourth part, with a conceptual and analytical framework, provides a general evaluation of women's entrepreneurship development in the country and policy insights for the future. Ecevit argues that there has been neither a holistic approach to women's employment, nor a general framework through which women's economic activities can be analyzed. Taking women's entrepreneurship as a single issue with no connections to a general women's employment policy or policies on women's empowerment would deteriorate the systematic and political character of the perspective and practice of entrepreneurship support interventions.

For full version of the report:

www.ilo.ch/public/english/region/eurpro/ankara/publ/womenentr.pdf

Ioannis Avgenikou, Renata Camargo, Lantana Elhassan, Tonito Fernandes, Iyad Issa, Meghna Patel, Natalia Villamizar, Suzaini Zaid, Mi Zhang, "Placing Sulukule: Towards / Alternative Proposal to Conserve the Living Heritage of Roman Culture", June 2007.

Placing Sulukule is a fieldwork based project carried out by the MSc Building and Urban Design in Development, from the Development Planning Unit (UCL). The context of the work is the neighbourhood of Sulukule, now under threat of demolitions due to the 'urgent' urban transformation proposals in the pipeline. In the project they base their analysis on three objectives. Firstly, they provide an image of Sulukule in 5 years via pointing out the need for a physical intervention based on understanding of the local social, economic and cultural relationships within Sulukule and within the context of Istanbul so as to highlight the Romani community's way of living in a qualified urban context. Secondly, they emphasize the need to implement a 'participatory approach' which involves the community in the decision making process. This participatory approach must be based on strong community organisation should give the community the capacity to participate actively in design, implementation and maintenance of different interventions, which may either be proposed by the community or by other actors in dialogue with the community. Finally, they highlight "the opportunity to open a discussion on local development planning alternatives through a multi-actor process" which can be seen as a step forward in which different actors, lead by the municipality, can demonstrate their commitment and put forth physical proposals for the development of the area, which will be achieved through participatory process.

For further details:

http://www.ucl.ac.uk/dpu/final%20report%20modified%20screen%2021_June_2007%20with%20a pp.pdf

Didem Gurses, "Development of A Comprehensive Policy to Fight Child Poverty In Turkey", 2006 International Conference of the Human Development and Capability Association, Groningen-The Netherlands.

In this paper the manifestation of poverty in contemporary Turkey has been examined in relation to the socioeconomic transformations that have led to the emergence of poverty. After the poverty profile of the country is given, child poverty in the country is examined in relation to maternal and child health, child education and child labour. It has been observed that although Turkey has made

improvements in her social indicators during the last decades, the situation of women and children continue to be marked by problems due to the existence of geographical, economical and cultural disparities all over the country. An assessment of the social protection mechanisms currently existing in Turkey is presented with special reference to the policies adopted after the 2001 economic crisis. It has been observed that the recent economic developments had forced Turkey to adopt a proactive role in struggling against poverty. Although Turkey has a growing problem of poverty, it is difficult to argue that there is an effective policy to abate it. On the contrary the existing anti-poverty programs are rather too narrow as they are constructed during the financial crisis. This paper, argues that the capability approach as a particular method to understanding and explaining all forms and dimensions of poverty, offers a comprehensive framework and a sound theoretical approach for the development of anti-poverty policies.

See further:

http://www.capabilityapproach.com/pubs/6_4_Gurses.pdf?PHPSESSID=79fd2c0e120614e47a7064bb2a154d46

Meltem Dayıoglu, 'The Impact of Household Income on Child Labour in Urban Turkey', <i>Journal of Development Studies</i> , Vol 42:6, August 2006, p. 939 – 956.

The aim of this study is to investigate the determinants of child labour in urban Turkey with a special reference to low household income or poverty as one of its root causes. Studies done elsewhere have produced mixed results which necessitate the relationship to be studied at country-level. The data from urban Turkey indicate that children from poorer families stand at a higher risk of employment. In times of crisis, the household might respond to the deteriorating market conditions by first liquidating the household assets and then, putting the child to work. In this sense, minor economic downturns might not be as alarming, though major economic crisis like that of 2001 might very well push more children to the labour market as households move from being income poor to asset poor. This finding is confirmed using various measures of household material well-being. Simulation results have further pointed out that current interventions are not likely to produce a sizeable impact on the child labour problem. While effective program development requires the careful evaluation of the responses of children and their families to various socioeconomic variables, the merits of following a holistic approach are also clear. The goal of increasing household income through transfers or the establishment of a household enterprise should be considered as part of an integrated poverty alleviation strategy, and not as stand-alone programs. Taking into account our finding that higher parental education reduces the risk of child employment, and the important links education has with earnings potential of parents and various dimensions of child welfare, a crucial component of any interventions strategy would include increasing the knowledge base of household on various matters ranging from business management to child welfare.